Don’t Settle:
Appreciative Advising for High Achieving Women

Andrea Clark, MA, Academic Advisor, andclark@umich.edu
Lauren Knoll, MA, Academic Advisor, lknoll@umich.edu
Stephen M. Ross School of Business
University of Michigan

Presented at:
What Happens in Advising Stays with Students
39th Annual NACADA Conference
Las Vegas, Nevada
October 4-7, 2015
How have you seen your high achieving students be afraid?
Mattering

“Mattering refers to our belief, whether right or wrong, that we matter to someone else. This belief acts as a motivator.” (Schlossberg, p. 9)

“Are we part of things; do we belong; are we central or marginal? Do we make a difference; do others care about us and make us feel we matter?” (Schlossberg, p. 6)

Mattering is:
- the belief that we matter to someone else
- a motivator that drives behavior
- significant during transitions from old roles to new roles

Mattering happens when someone….
- notices you and depends on you
- cares about you
- feels emotion as a result of your accomplishments or failures
- depends on you or needs you
- notices and recognizes you for positive reasons

Sense of Belonging

“The psychological dimension of belonging refers to feeling valued, needed, and significant within a system or environment…” (Strayhorn, p. 11)

“…sense of belonging is framed as a basic human need and motivation, sufficient to influence behavior. In this way, it is not only an important aspect of college student life, but relevant to life for all of us…” (Strayhorn, p. 17)

Sense of belonging is:
- a basic human need
- a motivator that drives behavior
- significant in certain contexts, times, and among marginalized populations
- not constant--it must be satisfied on a continual basis
- impacted by social identities
- tied to many positive outcomes

Why are mattering and sense of belonging important during college?
- Empowers and builds self-efficacy
- Motivates and encourages
- Maximizes potential to flourish
- Creates comfort during transitions
- Inspires self-confidence to move forward
**Appreciative Advising (Jenny Bloom)**

Appreciative Advising is the intentional collaborative practice of asking positive, open-ended questions that help students optimize their educational experiences and achieve their dreams, goals, and potentials.

[http://www.appreciativeadvising.net/what-is-appreciative-advising.html](http://www.appreciativeadvising.net/what-is-appreciative-advising.html)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Disarm</strong></th>
<th>Make a positive first impression with the student, build rapport, and create a safe, welcoming space.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discover</strong></td>
<td>Ask positive open-ended questions that help advisors learn about students’ strengths, skills, and abilities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dream</strong></td>
<td>Inquire about students’ hopes and dreams for their futures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Design</strong></td>
<td>Student and advisor co-create a plan for making dreams a reality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Deliver</strong></td>
<td>The student delivers on the plan created during the Design phase and the advisor is available to encourage and support students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Don’t Settle</strong></td>
<td>Advisors and students alike need to set their own internal bars of expectations high.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Appreciative Advisors Lean In**

“We can reignite the revolution by internalizing the revolution. The shift to a more equal world will happen person by person. We move closer to the large goal of true equality with each woman who leans in.”

(Sandberg, p. 13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>SIT AT THE TABLE:</strong> Recognize you have an important role to play and don’t put yourself on the sidelines. Be confident in your abilities. The imposter syndrome can be a self-fulfilling prophecy: pretend to feel confident and you will.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>DISCOVER:</strong> What is your proudest accomplishment and why? <strong>DREAM:</strong> If you could lead any corporation or non-profit, what would it be and why? <strong>DELIVER:</strong> How will you stay fully engaged with your school or workplace?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DON’T SACRIFICE BEING LIKED FOR BEING SUCCESSFUL:</strong> Owning success is key to more success. Success and likeability are correlated positively for men and negatively for women. Connecting with others is key to success, especially when negotiating.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DISCOVER:</strong> What relationships are important to you? <strong>DELIVER:</strong> How will you measure and celebrate your success? <strong>DON’T SETTLE:</strong> How will you use your accomplishments to give back to others?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHOOSE GROWTH:</strong> Adopt creative exploration in your career search. Seek opportunities for their potential for growth, even if you don’t feel 100% qualified. Learn by doing. Avoid the “tiara syndrome”—don’t wait for promotions to come to you without self-advocacy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DREAM:</strong> If money or skills weren’t an issue, what would be your long-term dream? <strong>DESIGN:</strong> Short term plan—How will this plan push you out of your comfort zone? <strong>DON’T SETTLE:</strong> What is one area where you would still like to grow?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SEEK INPUT AND FEEDBACK:</strong> Mentorship and sponsorship is an important part of career growth. Excel first, then get a mentor: being successful and asking for feedback naturally leads to authentic mentorship relationships.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **DISCOVER:** What is the best type of feedback you have received? **DON’T SETTLE:** Now that you are done with (major project, exams, etc), have you considered seeking feedback from (peers, supervisor, professor)?
**SEEK AND SPEAK YOUR TRUTH:** Be an authentic communicator: request advice, be open about feedback, recognize weaknesses. Share your emotions with others; bring your whole self to your work.

**DISCOVER:** What is something I don’t know about you now that I would know about you after working with you for three months?

**DON’T SETTLE:** What is one thing you could do to improve your performance even better?

**DON’T LEAVE BEFORE YOU LEAVE:** “Don’t enter the workforce already looking for the exit. Don’t put on the brakes. Accelerate.” (p. 130). Keep your options and opportunities open.

**DREAM:** List the accomplishments you’ll have achieved in ten years.

**DON’T SETTLE:** What is the new plan “A”, now that you have reached your goal?

**DON’T SETTLE:** Now that you are in job X or school Y, how will you make an impact?

**DON’T STRIVE FOR PERFECTION:** Instead of subscribing to the myth of doing it all, do what is most important for you and your family. Long-term success depends on not meeting every definition of perfection.

**DISCOVER:** Who is important in your life and what do you want to do for them?

**DISCOVER:** How does career choice X impact your community?

**DON’T SETTLE:** What did this experience tell you about your strengths and values?

**TALK ABOUT IT:** Talk openly about behavioral patterns and the impact your gender identity has on you. Small interventions can lead to major societal changes. Speak up and encourage others to be open listeners.

**DISCOVER:** Who are your role models? Why do you look up to them? What qualities do they have that you hope to have one day?

**DREAM:** What kind of world and workplace are you imagining for yourself?

**OWN WHO YOU ARE:** Speak up and stand out. Understand the unique value you add to an organization. Be aware of your own cultural biases. Learn to be comfortable being uncomfortable. (Hobson)

**DESIGN:** Who is an important part of your life and community to lean on for support?

**DELIVER:** What resources will you use when you encounter obstacles?

**DON’T SETTLE:** What is one thing you can do to step outside of your comfort zone?
Case Studies

**Discussion Questions:**
1. Which phase of Appreciative Advising might be useful here? Are there concepts from Mattering or Sense of Belonging that can be applied? Which Lean In principles are relevant?
2. Have you experienced something similar in your own personal or work life?
3. How will you approach this advising conversation?

**Case 1: Outwardly Obligated**
Sarah is a first year student with high hopes to pursue a career in business. She is the first in her family to attend college and is part of a first year program designed to help with the transition to college. She is motivated and interested in consulting, a highly competitive business field. She has had mediocre performance on her two Economics exams, and realized that the subject was more challenging at the college level than she encountered in high school. Her Economics final exam is next week and she feels she can do well if she studies. However, her family places a lot of importance on celebrating birthdays and her younger sister’s birthday is this week. She lives close by, and feels compelled to spend time with her family tonight, on a weeknight. She also shares with you that she feels she has been missing out on friends going out on the weekends, and may try to fit in time with friends this weekend before the end of the semester. Her final grade in Economics will be a major determining factor in her competitiveness for a business program and consulting internships.

**Case 2: Suddenly Scared**
Ashley is a junior who has always been one of your program’s highest performers. Her grades have been consistently above her peers and she is involved in many leadership and service activities. About a year ago, she mentioned she was interested in applying to Harvard University for graduate study. She has intentionally planned courses that lead to this path. As she approaches her senior year, you decide to follow up with her on this goal. She admits to you she is not sure if she will move forward in submitting an application; she is nervous about asking for recommendations. She says “It’s a bit presumptuous for me to think that I could get in, and it’s pretty bold to assume that by asking for recommendations.”

**Case 3: Future Financier**
Mary is a very high achieving sophomore. During her first year, she was part of a very selective program that guarantees outstanding high school seniors admission to your business program. She likes the quantitative areas of business and is considering a career in Accounting or Finance. During an April meeting about class registration, you ask her to share how her winter semester classes are going. She discusses her overall schedule and states that “classes have been busy but fine.” She adds that there are not many women in her Accounting and Finance elective classes. She also shares that she noticed that “it took two full weeks for any woman in the class to participate in the class discussion.” She states that she is beginning to question if she fits in.

**Case 4: Hardly Heard**
Jennifer, a senior, is participating on a six person group project in an advanced honors course. She schedules a meeting with you to talk through her concerns about her group project in the course. She shares with you that the men in the group do not seem to be taking her comments (or the comments of the other female group member) seriously. She tells you that the men all know each other and are brushing off her comments and feedback. She is very concerned because she thinks the group has done some of the calculations incorrectly, but she can’t seem to be heard. The group is presenting their final project in two weeks and has an upcoming group meeting tomorrow afternoon.
Want to learn more?

- View our prezi: [http://prezi.com/6vdd4dhrksxd/?utm_campaign=share&utm_medium=copy&rc=ex0share](http://prezi.com/6vdd4dhrksxd/?utm_campaign=share&utm_medium=copy&rc=ex0share)
- Read Lean In.
- Watch successful women leaders: [http://www.makers.com/](http://www.makers.com/)
- Find a Lean In circle near you: [http://leanincircles.org/](http://leanincircles.org/)
- Be informed about student identity groups
- Attend the Appreciative Advising Institute or get certified in Appreciative Advising: [http://www.appreciativeadvising.net/certification.html](http://www.appreciativeadvising.net/certification.html)
- Check in with your own mentors
- Follow us on Flipboard app: [http://flip.it/eVMo9](http://flip.it/eVMo9)
Resources


*What is appreciative advising?* Retrieved from http://www.appreciativeadvising.net/what-is-appreciative-advising.html


View our curated magazine of current articles in popular press: http://flip.it/eVMo9